Review

The mental health of children orphaned by AIDS: a review of international and southern African research

Lucie Cluver1,2* and Frances Gardner1

1 Department of Social Policy and Social Work, University of Oxford, 32 Wellington Square, Oxford OX1 2ER, UK
2 Cape Town Child Welfare Society, PO Box 374, Gatesville 7766, Cape Town, South Africa
* Corresponding author, e-mail: lucie.cluver@socres.ox.ac.uk

This paper reviews research on the mental health and psychological outcomes of children who are orphaned by AIDS. Studies are limited, scattered and often unpublished. The review focuses on research which is quantitative and based on primary research with uninfected children who are parentally bereaved by AIDS. Due to the limited available quantitative research in this area, both controlled and uncontrolled studies are included. Selected qualitative and related literature is also reviewed, with a focus on work relevant to the southern African context. This paper builds upon and updates Wild’s seminal review, published in this journal in 2001 (Wild 2001). We found 24 studies worldwide, with wide variations in sample characteristics, outcome measurements and control groups. Three of these studies are ongoing. Internalising problems in orphaned children were found in 16 studies (of the 19 studies which measured them) and externalising problems were found in five studies (of 10 which measured them). There is a clear need for further, and rigorous, research into mental health, and risk and protective factors for children orphaned by AIDS. Furthermore, it is critical that research adopts a more coordinated approach, which allows for meaningful comparisons of child outcomes in different areas.

Introduction

By 2005, 15.2 million children had been orphaned by AIDS worldwide (UNICEF/WHO 2006). In South Africa alone, an estimated 1.37 million South African children were maternal or ‘double’ orphans by 2005, with 830 000 of these orphaned by AIDS. Even with continued administration of the national antiretroviral programme, orphan numbers are predicted to peak at 2.3 million in 2020 (Dorrington et al. 2005).

Orphans frequently lack sufficient food, shelter, schooling and medical care, and are at risk of abuse and economic exploitation (ACESS 2002, Berry and Guthrie 2003, Giese et al. 2003). Recent research finds evidence of lower school enrolment and attendance amongst maternally-orphaned children (Case and Ardington 2005), and of higher HIV prevalence amongst orphans aged 16–24 (Operario et al. 2007).

There is limited available research, but increasing concern, regarding the psychological well-being of children orphaned by AIDS. These children are exposed to multiple stressors which may compound and complicate the grieving process. They may have cared for, and witnessed the deaths of, a parent or parents with a debilitating illness, loss of bodily functions and possibly AIDS-related mental illness (Olley et al. 2003, Tedstone and Tarrier 2003). Children may experience multiple losses, for example of mother, father and perinatally-infected younger siblings. Caregivers
of orphans have been found to experience poorer psychological health than other caregivers (Ferreira, Keikelame and Mosaval 2001, Manuel 2002), and research in other populations suggests a correlation between caregiver and child distress. South African orphans report experience of stigma and secrecy surrounding AIDS, leading to social isolation, bullying and reduced opportunity to discuss grief (Bray 2003, Giese et al. 2003, Cluver and Gardner in press). Poor communication can lead to children’s ignorance of causes of parental death, or fears that they will also be infected (Marcus 1999).

This review focuses on research which is quantitative and explores psychological outcomes amongst uninfected children orphaned by AIDS. Both controlled and uncontrolled studies are included. Selected qualitative research, survey data and other helpful literature, with a focus on the southern African context, are also reviewed.

Definitions and parameters of the review

UNAIDS definitions of ‘children orphaned by AIDS’ include distinctions between maternal, paternal and double orphans (where both parents have died). All of these groups are included under the definition of ‘total orphans’ (UNAIDS, UNICEF 2002).

Current debate in sub-Saharan Africa suggests the need for a wider definition of ‘orphanhood’ than parental bereavement. For example, the Children’s Institute (University of Cape Town) proposes the following definition:

… children whose care is compromised as a result of one of the following: The terminal illness of an adult who contributes to the care and/or financial support of the child, or the death of an adult who contributed substantially to the care and/or financial support of the child. (Giese et al. 2003)

Whilst recognising that both death and illness of parental and non-parental caregivers may have important effects on children, this review focuses on children who have been parentally bereaved (one or both parents). However, some of the research studies included in this review have used a wider definition of orphanhood, such as Wild et al. (2006), which includes children bereaved by any primary caregiver.

There is also debate around the age range of ‘orphanhood’. The UN definition has moved from an upper limit of 15 years (UNAIDS, UNICEF 2002) to 18 years (UNAIDS 2004), in concurrence with both the UNICEF definition of childhood (UNICEF 1989) and the South African Constitution (Republic of South Africa 1996). This review uses the current definition, but some (especially earlier) studies follow the previous limit of 15 years.

This review does not focus on orphaned children who are also HIV-positive, although the mental health of this group is clearly an important area of research. There is growing evidence that an HIV-positive diagnosis and illness have adverse mental health effects, independent of orphanhood, in both adults (Olley et al. 2003, Tedstone and Tarrier 2003, Brandt 2004, Baingana, Thomas and Comblain 2005) and children (Gosling, Burns and Hirst 2004, Green and Smith 2004, Nozyce, Lee and Wiznia 2006). Furthermore, children may experience AIDS-related psychosis through syndromes such as encephalopathy, and AIDS-associated dementia or delirium at later stages of illness. Possible psychiatric effects of HIV infection include neurocognitive impairment and sleep disorders. The relationship between depression and decreases in immune function in children is not yet clear (McDaniel et al. 2000), although UK studies suggest increased prevalence of concentration, behavioural and emotional problems (Gosling et al. 2004). Some HIV-infected children receive psychological support through treatment programmes, whilst others do not. Thus, HIV infection has multiple effects which may confound or exacerbate the effects of orphanhood on child mental health. Whilst recognising the importance of further research on this vulnerable group, this review does not include studies which are limited to clinical samples of HIV-positive children.

Search strategy

This review draws on both published and unpublished empirical studies. Keyword searches were made of a number of electronic databases (PsycINFO, Medline, the Index to South African
Periodicals/ISAP, BMJ, TDNet, the British Library database, Zetoc, Cambridge Scientific Abstracts, Web of Science), the online publications of several organisations (UNAIDS, UNESCO, UNICEF, World Health Organisation/WHO) and government publications (South Africa, Botswana, Mozambique, Uganda, Lesotho, Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe). In addition, several print publications were hand-searched (the AIDS Bulletin, ChildrenFIRST (SA) and Children’s Institute publications), a number of HIV/AIDS conference websites were inspected, and dissertation/thesis searches were carried out on SABINET (1995–2005), SilverPlatter and Dissertation Abstracts International. Additional studies were located through personal recommendations, e-mailed requests to academics, web searches (Google, Google Scholar, Yahoo, Altavista, findarticles.com) and existing reviews (Siegal and Gorey 1994, Wild 2001, Stein 2003).

**Results**

**Quantitative studies**

There have been relatively few published empirical studies on the psychological well-being of children orphaned by AIDS. Thorough searching revealed 24 studies worldwide, of which five were conducted in the USA and 19 in Africa. Thirteen of the studies are currently unpublished. Of the unpublished studies identified, one was only available as a conference abstract (Makaya et al. 2002) and two were thesis abstracts which could not be accessed (Gelman 2003) or not accessed in full (Hirsch 2001).

Of the 23 studies with sampling information available, seven were descriptive and lacked control groups. Sixteen studies compared orphaned children with some kind of control group. All of the Africa-based studies, and all but two of the US studies, were cross-sectional. In 18 studies, children were interviewed directly, while four relied on caregiver reports. Of the three ongoing studies, one in Rwanda (Brown, Thurman and Snider 2005) has published interim findings.

We must be cautious in assuming generalisability between studies conducted in diverse parts of Africa, due to variations in social, cultural and economic circumstances. It should also be noted that there may be difficulties translating US studies into an African context, due to differences in support systems and characteristics of HIV-infected groups. Samples in the US, often recruited through services, may also reflect a support system with superior resources which are concentrated on far fewer children than is the case in African contexts.

**Controlled studies in Africa**

Poulter (1996), in Zambia, interviewed carers in 22 households with orphans, 66 households with HIV-positive parents, and 75 control families. However, as controls were randomly selected from the community, this group may have included HIV-affected families. The researchers used the Rutter Scales (Rutter, Tizard and Whitmore 1970) with caregivers. Caregivers reported that orphans were significantly more likely to be unhappy or worried than children with HIV-positive parents, and both groups were significantly more likely to be unhappy, worried, fearful, solitary and fearful of new situations than children in non-affected families (no p-values reported). The study found no clear link between psychological disturbance and economic stress. It also found no evidence of conduct disorders or antisocial behaviour.

Sengendo and Nambi (1997) interviewed 169 orphans under the education sponsorship of World Vision in Uganda, and a comparison group of 24 non-orphans (using systematic random sampling from all eligible sponsored youth). They used a non-standardised 25-item depression scale and interviews with orphans, teachers and some guardians. They found that orphans had significantly higher depression scores (p < .05) and lower optimism about the future than non-orphans (p < .05).

Makame, Ani and McGregor (2002), in urban Tanzania, interviewed 41 orphans and 41 non-orphaned controls, using a non-standardised internalising problems scale based on the Rand Mental Health Inventory (Veit-Wilson 1998) and items from the Beck Depression Inventory (Beck et al. 1961). They found that orphans had increased internalising problems compared with non-orphans (p < .0001), and 34% reported that they had contemplated suicide in the past year, compared to 12% of non-orphans (p < .016).
Manuel (2002), in rural Mozambique, used a non-standardised internalising problems questionnaire adapted from the instrument used by Makame et al. (2002). They interviewed 76 orphans, 74 non-orphaned controls from the area, and their carers. Orphans had higher depression scores ($p < .001$), were more likely to be bullied ($p < .001$), and were less likely to have a trusted adult or friends ($p < .001$). Caregivers of orphans reported more depression ($p < .001$) and less social support than for the controls.

Atwine et al. (2005), in rural Uganda, interviewed 123 orphaned children and 110 matched non-orphaned controls aged 11–15. Using the Beck Youth Inventory (BYI) (Beck et al. 1961), it was found that orphans were more likely to be anxious ($OR = 6.4$), depressed ($OR = 6.6$) and to display anger ($OR = 5.1$), and showed significantly higher scores for feelings of hopelessness and suicidal ideation. A range of questions was asked concerning current and past living conditions, and a multivariate analysis of factors with possible relevance for BYI outcomes found that orphan status was the only significant predictor of outcomes.

In Rwanda and Zambia, Chatterji et al. (2005) compared orphans, children with chronically ill caregivers, and non-affected children. Children aged 6–12 ($n = 1 160$) completed a seven-item unstandardised ‘worry/stress’ scale developed from existing instruments. On this scale, Zambian orphans scored higher than children with ill caregivers, who scored higher than other children ($p < .04$). In Rwanda, there were no differences between orphans and children with ill caregivers, but both groups scored higher than other children ($p < .03$). In Rwanda, worry/stress was correlated with socioeconomic status ($p < .03$) and community cohesion ($p < .001$).

In Ethiopia, Bhargava (2005) analysed data from a survey of 479 children who had been maternally orphaned by AIDS, with a control group of 574 children orphaned for other reasons. Children completed 60 items from the 657-item Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory 2 (MMPI) (Hathaway and McKinley 1989), with subscales of social adjustment ($\alpha = .80$) and emotional adjustment ($\alpha = .86$). Children orphaned by AIDS showed more emotional and social adjustment problems, and girls reported higher levels of difficulties than boys. Significant predictors of higher scores in both groups included presence of the father, school attendance, household income, clothing conditions, distribution of food and emotional support within the fostering family.

Cluver and Gardner (2006) interviewed 30 children orphaned by AIDS, and 30 matched non-orphaned controls, in Cape Town, South Africa. Standardised questionnaires were used: the Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire (Goodman 1997) and the Impacts of Events Scale (Dyregrov and Yule 1995). Both groups scored highly for peer problems, emotional problems and total scores. However, orphans were more likely to view themselves as having no good friends ($p = .002$), to have marked concentration difficulties ($p = .03$), and to report frequent somatic symptoms ($p = .05$), but were less likely to display anger through loss of temper ($p = .03$). Orphans were more likely to have constant nightmares ($p = .01$), and 73% scored above the cut-off for post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). However, the PTSD scale was not administered to the non-orphaned control group.

A national survey in Zimbabwe (Nyamukapa et al. 2006) applied factor analysis to compare orphans and non-orphaned children aged 12–17 ($n = 5 321$). Psychosocial disorders were measured using a 16-item unstandardised scale, with items from the Child Behaviour Checklist, Rand Mental Health and Beck Depression Inventories. Findings showed more psychosocial disorders amongst orphans ($p < .05$), which remained when controlling for poverty, gender, age of household head, school enrolment and adult support. Depression showed group differences, but anxiety did not.

Also in Zimbabwe, Gilborn et al. (2006) interviewed 1 258 orphans and vulnerable children, comparing groups by exposure to various psychosocial support programmes. An unstandardised instrument was developed from formative qualitative research, and included six items suggestive of depression and two items suggestive of poor psychosocial well-being. Orphans reported higher stress ($p < .05$) and more psychosocial distress ($p < .05$).

Wild et al. (2006) have recently completed a study with adolescents (10–19 years old) in the Eastern Cape of South Africa. They compared 81 AIDS-orphaned children, 78 orphaned as a result
of deaths not related to AIDS, and 43 non-orphans. AIDS-orphaned children were recruited through NGOs. The researchers used the Revised Children’s Manifest Anxiety Scale (R-CMAS) (Reynolds and Richmond 1978), the 10-item Child Depression Inventory (CDI) (Kovacs 1992), items from the Child Behavior Checklist (CBCL-YSR) (Achenbach 1991), and items from the Self-esteem Questionnaire (DuBois et al. 1996). The study also looked at potential moderating factors of adult, peer and neighbourhood connection and regulation, and psychological autonomy. Findings showed that adolescents orphaned as a result of deaths unrelated to AIDS reported more depression (p < .05) and anxiety (p < .05) than non-orphans, with AIDS orphan scores falling between the two groups and not differing significantly from either. There were no group differences in terms of externalising problems. ‘Other’ orphans showed lower self-esteem than both non-orphans and AIDS orphans. Of the potential protective factors for all orphans, greater autonomy from caregiver and greater neighbourhood regulation were significantly associated with lower anxiety (p < .001). Greater connection with caregiver and greater peer regulation were associated with lower depression (p < .001) (Wild et al. 2006).

In Cape Town, South Africa, Cluver, Gardner and Operario (2007) interviewed 1 061 children (455 orphaned by AIDS, matched controls of 278 non-orphaned children and 243 orphaned as a result of deaths from other causes, with 85 children orphaned as a result of deaths from unknown causes). Standardised psychological questionnaires included the Child Depression Inventory (Kovacs 1992), The Revised Children’s Manifest Anxiety Scale (Reynolds and Richmond 1978), the Child Behaviour Checklist (Achenbach 1991) and the Children’s PTSD Checklist (Amaya-Jackson, Newman and Lipschitz 2000), with many scales matched to those used in the South African Eastern Cape study (Wild et al. in press), to allow for cross-provincial comparison. The study also explored a range of potential risk and protective factors identified through qualitative data (Cluver and Gardner 2007), and suggested by a range of NGOs and South African government departments. AIDS-orphaned children reported higher levels of depression, peer problems, post-traumatic stress, conduct problems and delinquency (p < .001) than both non-orphaned children and children orphaned as a result of deaths from other causes. Differences remained when controlling for socio-demographic factors such as age, gender, poverty, migration and household composition. No differences were found in terms of anxiety. Multivariate and mediational analyses found strong mediational effects of risk factors — poverty, stigma and caregiver illness — and of protective factors such as receipt of social security and school attendance (all p < .001).

In Kenya, Elmore-Meegan et al. (in prep.) initially used the Achenbach Child Behaviour Checklist with orphaned and vulnerable children, but found the schedule overlong (R Conroy pers. comm.). They are currently developing a short problem behaviour scale based on caregiver report, and gathering data on 400 children.

An ongoing study in Uganda (Lamphear and Jones in prep.) compares levels of PTSD in AIDS-orphaned children (137) with matched control groups of orphans of non-AIDS causes (98) and non-orphans (99). No information is as yet available regarding this study, but the authors supplied the following information: children (aged 8–18) completed the Child’s Reaction to Traumatic Events Scale (Jones, Fletcher and Ribbe 2002), which measures PTSD arousal, avoidance and intrusive symptoms. Teachers completed the Parent Report of Post-traumatic Symptoms (PROPS). An unstandardised semi-structured interview questionnaire measured exposure to current and past traumatic events, in order to identify risk and protective factors that might moderate children’s PTSD and psychosocial adjustment.

**Controlled studies in the USA**

measured symptoms amongst children whilst their parents were HIV-positive and alive, and then six months after parental death. The researchers used the Child Behaviour Checklist (Achenbach and Edelbrock 1987) and the Child Depression Index (Kovacs 1992). Children of HIV-positive mothers showed more emotional and behavioural problems and lower cognitive and social competence than the control group (p < .05). Six months after the death of their parents, there were non-significant improvements in orphans’ psychosocial adjustment.

The most recent paper within this longitudinal study (Pelton and Forehand 2005) compared the same group of orphaned children before and two years after maternal death from AIDS, with two comparison groups of children with living HIV-positive mothers and children with living non-infected mothers. Caregivers completed Child Behaviour Checklists on 105 6–11-year-olds (all African-American). Findings indicated that, relative to those in one of the two control groups, more orphans had clinical levels of emotional and behavioural problems, both before parental death and at two years after parental death. Thus, the six-month finding of non-significant improvements (described above) may not indicate long-term effects of orphanhood.

Hirsch (2001) compared 16 children (under age 12) whose mothers had died of AIDS with 18 children whose mothers had died due to other causes. Some children were HIV-positive (number not given). Attachment security was measured using the Attachment Q-Set (van Dam and van Ijzendoorn 1988) and anxiety, depression and conduct were measured using scales from the Behaviour Assessment System for Children (BASC-PRS) (Reynolds and Kamphaus 1992). Results found no significant differences between groups for attachment security. Children orphaned as a result of death from causes other than AIDS showed higher levels of depression, anxiety and conduct problems than AIDS-orphaned children, although neither group’s mean scores were generally within the clinical range. Recruitment method was not stated (this is an abstract for an unpublished thesis), but a reference to the AIDS-orphaned children receiving social services suggests that participants were recruited through services.

In New York, an intervention-based study (Rotheram-Borus, Stein and Lin 2001, Rotheram-Borus et al. 2004) used longitudinal assessments with standardised instruments. The study compared adolescents orphaned by AIDS (73) with adolescents whose parents were alive and HIV-positive (138). At two years after parental death, the researchers found that bereaved children reported more emotional distress on the Brief Symptom Inventory (Derogatis and Melisaratos 1983) and more problem behaviours (smoking, alcohol, crime and aggressive behaviour) than children whose parents were still alive (p < .05). Further factors increasing adolescent distress at two years after parental death included baseline severity of parental physical health symptoms and parental emotional distress. Post-intervention results found significant differences of fewer problem behaviours and fewer sexual partners amongst the intervention group, but no effect on emotional distress.

Descriptive studies in Africa
A number of studies without control groups have also been carried out in Africa. Foster et al. (1997) conducted focus-group discussions and non-standardised interviews with 40 orphans, 25 caregivers and 33 community workers in rural Zimbabwe. Children reported anxiety, fear, stigmatisation from friends and community, depression and stress. Nampanya-Serpell (1998) interviewed the families of 645 urban orphans and 291 rural orphans in Zambia. Structured interviews with caregivers (but not children) were used, and the study cautions that this made interpretation difficult ‘with respect to the influence of caregiver identity and familiarity’. A non-standardised ‘Emotional Well-being Checklist’ was developed to measure internalising and externalising problems, and was administered to caregivers. Findings in the urban (but not rural) sample indicate that orphans separated from siblings showed more emotional disturbance (p < .05). In the rural (but not urban) sample, a higher number of adults in the caregiving family was associated with more reported emotional disturbance in the children (p < .001).

Volle et al. (2002) interviewed 788 adolescent orphans, randomly selected from four districts in Zambia. They used non-standardised interviews conducted by interviewers and psychosocial
support workers. They found that 89% of orphans were ‘always or sometimes unhappy’, and 18.6% had run away from their new homes. Makaya et al. (2002), in the Democratic Republic of Congo, used interviews with 354 orphans, conducted by clinical psychologists. They found that 20.1% presented ‘psychological troubles’, and of those 34% had ‘affective troubles — depression, anxiety, irritability, rivalry feeling’. Twenty-seven per cent had ‘adaption troubles — school or home fugue, robbery tendency, offending and hyperkinetic behaviour’; 39% were experiencing post-traumatic stress. Only a conference abstract could be found for this study.

In Rwanda, World Vision interviewed 692 heads of youth-headed households (aged up to 25; 72% aged 19–24), orphaned as a result of death from a number of causes, including AIDS and war. Various standardised scales were either incorporated into or informed the survey instrument. Initial findings from the Center for Epidemiological Studies Depression Scale (CES-D) (Radloff 1977) report that 55% of child household heads scored above the cut-off for depression and 4% reported suicide attempts in the previous two months. Females scored higher for both depression (p < .05) and suicide attempts. Males reported more externalising behaviours, such as delinquency and substance abuse (Brown et al. 2005). This survey served as baseline data for an ongoing community intervention, and findings from both further scales and longitudinal data are anticipated.

One study found in Africa could not be accessed. Gelman (2003), a study conducted in Zimbabwe, is mentioned by Germann (2004). However, this reports only the finding that existing psychometric tools developed in the West, should not be used in culturally different settings as results cannot be validated. The author of this study has been contacted for further information, but no responses have been received.

Descriptive studies in the USA
The New York City Division of AIDS Services (Draimim, Hudis and Segura 1992, Hudis 1995) used quantitative standardised instruments (scales not given) with 59 children and caregivers aged 10–19. Half the children were orphaned and half had living HIV-positive parents. There was no non-affected control group. Thirty-four per cent of caregivers reported youth externalising problems, 73% of the youths reported problems at school, and 58% reported a decline in school work, linked to parental illness; 38% reported peer relationship problems.

Also in New York, Pivnick and Villegas (2000) interviewed 25 children aged 10–18, all of whom were orphaned or had a parent who was HIV-positive. Participants were recruited from a mental health and primary healthcare programme for HIV-positive women. There was no control group. The researchers used ethnographic and clinical interviews and the Beck Depression Inventory (Beck et al. 1961). Findings included heightened anxiety and depression, as well as sleeping, eating and somatisation problems. Children also reported difficulty concentrating at school. No evidence was found of conduct problems or risk behaviours.

Qualitative studies
It is helpful to highlight some of the wider literature which contributes to understanding of mental health problems for orphaned children. Much of the early work on orphaned children was in the US and based on clinical experience or case studies (Levine and Dane 1994, Siegal and Gorey 1994, Geballe, Gruendal and Andiman 1995). Other non-quantitative research includes an unpublished psychotherapeutic exploration of orphans’ experiences in South Africa (Hough 2001).

Further studies do not focus on mental health, but use qualitative methods with affected and orphaned children in order to explore a range of issues. These can highlight potential factors influencing children’s distress, such as stigma (Strode and Barrett Grant 2001), poverty (ACESS 2002) and community relationships (Giese, Meintjies and Proudlock 2001).

Other helpful literature includes research on non-psychological aspects of orphan well-being, which may affect mental health. These include education, immunisation, caregiving and physical health. Literature is both international (Case, Paxson and Ableidinger 2002, UNAIDS 2004, Foster, Levine and Williamson 2005) and based in southern Africa (Ankrah 1993, Marcus 1999, Giese et al. 2003, Ansell and Young 2004, Richter, Manegold and Pather 2004). In South Africa, survey data
also provide useful information, often with large sample sizes, on orphan well-being. This includes data from demographic surveillance areas of the Africa Centre and Agincourt (Case and Ardington 2005), surveys focused on affected families (Vermaak et al. 2004) and nationally-representative surveys such as the National Youth HIV and Sexual Behaviour Study (Pettifor et al. 2003, Operario et al. 2007). A further useful report recommends revision of the UNICEF psychological indicators for monitoring of orphans and other vulnerable children (Snider and Dawes 2006).

Another source of information is reports of psychosocial or psychological interventions with orphaned children, both in sub-Saharan Africa (i.e. Denis and Makiwane 2001, Jewitt 2001, Bowsky et al. 2002, Kaseke and Germann 2002, Southern African AIDS Training Programme 2003) and worldwide (i.e. China View 2004, Safman 2004). These often constitute anecdotal evidence in the form of case studies, but do not provide empirical evidence about effectiveness.

There is a highly relevant (although small) body of research on the mental health outcomes of non-orphaned children living with HIV-positive or AIDS-affected parents. Children's psychological well-being pre-orphanhood will clearly relate to mental health post-orphanhood. Studies include ongoing South Africa-based research on mother-infant interaction (Stein et al. 2005, Brandt 2007), and on children and adolescents with HIV-positive parents, both in the developed world (Forsyth and Damour 1996, Esposito et al. 1999, Rotheram-Borus, Lightfoot and Shen 1999, Forehand et al. 2002) and developing countries (Poulter 1996). Only two longitudinal studies measure child outcomes both pre- and post-bereavement (Rotheram-Borus, Stein and Lin 2001, Forehand et al. 2002). This is an area which clearly requires further exploration, if we are to ensure that interventions for AIDS-affected children are introduced at the appropriate point in the bereavement process.

Further relevant research includes studies on HIV-positive children, many of whom are also parentally bereaved (Esposito et al. 1999, Divac, Melvin and Krechevsky 2003, Gosling, Burns and Hirst 2004). However, as discussed above, HIV-positive children have unique needs beyond those of orphanhood.

Discussion

Empirical research on the mental health of children orphaned by AIDS remains relatively limited, and some unpublished studies are difficult to access. The variability of studies in terms of recruitment, ages of children and choice of control groups and instruments makes comparison difficult and meta-analysis impossible. Inconsistencies between control groups create particular difficulties in determining effects of AIDS-orphanhood. For example, studies comparing AIDS-orphaned to non-orphaned children (without a control group of children orphaned as a result of death from non-AIDS causes) do not allow a separation of the effects of AIDS-orphanhood from those of orphanhood more generally. More longitudinal studies or studies with a control group of children living with caregivers who are ill with AIDS are also necessary. These can improve understanding of the chronology of distress for children within the process of parental illness and death.

Further methodological discrepancies include the choice of respondent. Children are more likely to under-report externalising problems, and caregivers are more likely to under-report children's internalising problems (Angold et al. 1987, Barrett et al. 1991). Agreement across informants of teachers, parents and children has been found to be low for multi-informant scales such as the Child Behaviour Checklist and Child Depression Inventory (Achenbach, McConaughy and Howell 1987). Ideally, future studies would compare reports from multiple informants, but this can be exceptionally difficult with regard to research with orphaned children who may have no adult carers (such as those in child-headed households), adult carers who do not know them well, or adult carers who are themselves unwell.

Interviewer characteristics are also important. Clinically-trained interviewers are helpful in terms of making diagnoses and in using instruments such as the K-SADS (Kaufman et al. 1996). But a shortage of qualified practitioners in sub-Saharan Africa (Swartz 2002) and the desirability of matching interviewers and participants by cultural group and language means that lay interviewers are a more realistic option. It is important that these interviewers are adequately trained in working
with vulnerable AIDS-affected children. Reliability can be improved by the checking of a subset of interviews by clinically-trained staff.

There are self-evident problems with the use of standardised scales which have been normed and validated on (almost exclusively) developed country populations (Carter et al. in press). However, the use of multiple newly-created instruments in studies of orphan well-being hinders the possibility of comparison across studies, as well as preventing analysis of clinical cut-offs which are provided by established scales. There is a clear need for scales to be normed on sub-Saharan African populations (Flisher forthcoming), and it is important that such scales be appropriate for use by non-clinically trained interviewers (Dawes et al. 2007). Until this has been achieved, we argue that the advantages of using a single set of standardised scales, across studies of orphanhood, would outweigh methodological difficulties of cross-cultural transferability.

Despite these limitations, a pooled approach to findings does reveal some patterns. Of the 13 controlled studies measuring internalising problems, 10 found evidence of heightened difficulties (eight in Africa, two in the US). The seven non-controlled studies are much harder to draw conclusions from. However, all non-controlled studies measuring internalising problems found evidence of difficulties (six in Africa, one in the US). Of the seven controlled studies measuring externalisingbehaviours such as conduct disorders, only three found evidence of increased difficulties (one in Africa, two in the US). Of the three non-controlled studies looking at externalising problems, two found evidence of difficulties (one African, one US). One study compared post-traumatic stress symptoms with control groups (Cluver et al. 2007). This found higher levels of symptoms and more children in the clinical range for PTSD amongst AIDS-orphaned children than amongst children orphaned as a result of non-AIDS causes and non-orphans. The remaining three studies measuring PTSD lacked non-orphan controls for this measure, were Africa-based, and all showed high levels of symptoms amongst orphans.

**Implications for future policy and research**

The evidence is still too limited for conclusive findings. However, there is increasing evidence of internalising problems amongst orphaned children, and much less evidence for externalising problems, especially in African studies. This review further challenges fears of orphaned children as ‘unsocialised’, ‘juvenile delinquents’ and ‘potential rebels’ (Barnett and Whiteside 2002, Hunter 1990), and may have implications for policy concerning orphanhood. The high number of studies finding internalising problems, and low number finding externalising problems, seem to suggest that (particularly in Africa) orphans are more likely to experience difficulties such as depression and anxiety than conduct disorders or problem behaviours.

A further finding of this review is that children orphaned by AIDS do seem to be experiencing high levels of psychological difficulties. However, the increase in studies in recent years still leaves the field uncertain as to the most appropriate targets for intervention. If future research is to inform interventions and policy for orphaned children, studies must look beyond the prevalence of psychological difficulties to explore factors in these children’s lives which are acting as stressors or buffers in mental health outcomes. In reviewing studies specifically addressing risk and protective factors in the psychological health of AIDS-orphaned children, we found only two (Wild et al. 2006, Cluver, Gardner and Operario in press), although some other studies include a helpful range of demographic data (i.e. Bhargava 2005). Evaluations of interventions such as Rotheram-Borus et al. (2004) and Brown et al. (2005) can also provide guidance on improving child outcomes.

AIDS-orphaned children do seem to be experiencing psychological distress. But it is important that we know more about whether this is specific to parental death from AIDS, or related to orphanhood from any cause. This will allow a stronger evidence base for policies and provision of aid, which currently fluctuate between focusing on AIDS-bereaved children and wider groups such as orphans and vulnerable children (OVCZ). Clarification is needed about whether these groups have distinct mental health needs or not. Ideally, research will also include larger sample sizes to allow for distinctions within groups. For example, caregiving arrangements post-bereavement may
influence mental health outcomes: life experiences may be very different for children living with grandmothers, non-kin foster parents, in child-headed households, or on the streets.

Conclusions

There are many challenges in conducting rigorous research with children orphaned by AIDS. These include practical complications of data collection in poor and sometimes high-crime areas (Robertson et al. 1999), and methodological difficulties of conducting AIDS-related research in contexts of stigma and secrecy. Few standardised psychological questionnaires have been normed in African countries, and therefore interpretation may be difficult. Ethical challenges include tensions between confidentiality and child protection concerns which are likely to arise from child reports, and the extent of children’s knowledge around causes of parental death. Furthermore, higher HIV and AIDS prevalence amongst the poorest communities means that many orphans live in contexts which are already high-risk for psychological problems such as PTSD (Ensink et al. 1997).

Despite such challenges, there is a growing evidence base on psychological outcomes for orphaned children. Wild’s review of 2001, in this journal, found eight studies (six published and two unpublished), of which only two were based in Africa, and only one compared orphaned to non-orphaned controls (Wild 2001). In five years, the number of studies has increased to 24, with an increased focus on sub-Saharan Africa. However, research has lagged far behind the rapid increase in orphan numbers. Whilst the evidence base is improving, it remains variable, often with small sample sizes and limited or no controls. Bray (2004) noted that ‘the most striking features of the literature existing on the impact of AIDS on children are the scarcity of reliable empirical data, and the alarming reliance of a few localised studies in supporting arguments on a more general level’.

Studies reviewed show wide discrepancies, particularly in choice of control groups and measurement instruments. Given the clear need for information in this area, we argue that future research could usefully aim for a more synchronised approach. This would allow for meta-analysis of findings (and thus more reliable conclusions) and would provide a valuable opportunity to compare different cohorts across time, between areas, and in differing socioeconomic and cultural settings. A co-ordinated approach would ideally comprise the use of a single set of standardised instruments (allowing for difficulties in cross-cultural use of such tools), and include groups of AIDS-orphaned children, children orphaned as a result of death from non-AIDS causes, non-orphaned children, and children living with unwell caregivers.

The epidemiology of orphaned children is also changing. Numbers of orphans are continuing to rise, the capacity of caregiving structures is changing in response, and there have been far-reaching developments in (and differing levels of access to) antiretroviral medication. As the geographical location of the AIDS epidemic changes, research is increasingly needed in areas of emerging epidemics such as China, India and Eastern Europe. If we are to respond to the needs of orphaned children, it is vital that we know more about the prevalence of psychological problems, and about risk and protective factors which can inform interventions. In addition, it is essential that we rigorously evaluate interventions and policies for this highly vulnerable group.

Acknowledgements — This project was supported by the Economic and Social Research Council (UK), the University of Oxford, and Cape Town Child Welfare.

References

Bray R (2003) *Predicting the Social Consequences of Orphanhood in South Africa*. Centre for Social Science Research, University of Cape Town, Cape Town
Cluver and Gardner


Hathaway S and McKinley J (1989) Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (MMPI-2). Merril/Prentice-Hall, Columbus, OH
Kovacs M (1992) Children’s Depression Inventory. Multi-health Systems, Niagara Falls, New York State, USA
Lamphear V and Jones R (in prep.) Post-traumatic Stress Disorder in Ugandan AIDS orphans. Save Africa’s Children, Los Angeles, California, USA
Marcus T (1999) Wo! Zaphela izingane - it is destroying the children - living and dying with AIDS. University of Natal, KwaZulu Natal, South Africa


Southern African AIDS Training Programme (2003) *Guidelines for Counselling Children who are Infected with HIV or Affected by HIV and AIDS*. SAT, Harare


Strode A and Barrett Grant K (2001) The role of stigma and discrimination in increasing the vulnerability of children and youth infected with and affected by HIV/AIDS. Save the Children (UK)


## Appendix 1: A brief summary of controlled studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country, date</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Sample characteristics</th>
<th>Control groups</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Standardised instruments?</th>
<th>Brief findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zambia (1996)</td>
<td>Poulter</td>
<td>22 households with orphans, 66 with HIV+ parents, 75 community controls</td>
<td>(1) Children with HIV+ parents (2) Community controls</td>
<td>Caregivers</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>Orphans more unhappy and worried than other groups. No evidence of conduct problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda (1997)</td>
<td>Sengendo and Nambi</td>
<td>169 AIDS-orphans; 24 non-orphans</td>
<td>Non-orphans</td>
<td>Children; teachers; some guardians</td>
<td>Unstandardised</td>
<td>Orphans had higher levels of depression and lower levels of optimism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania (2002)</td>
<td>Makame et al.</td>
<td>41 AIDS-orphans with 41 non-orphans</td>
<td>Non-orphans</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Unstandardised</td>
<td>Orphans showed higher levels of internalising problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mozambique (2002)</td>
<td>Manuel</td>
<td>76 AIDS-orphans; 74 non-orphans</td>
<td>Non-orphans</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Unstandardised</td>
<td>Orphans showed higher depression scores and wereless likely to have trusted adult or friend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda (2005)</td>
<td>Atwine et al.</td>
<td>123 AIDS-orphans; 110 non-orphans</td>
<td>Non-orphans</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>Orphans more anxious, depressed; more anger, hopelessness and suicidal ideation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda and Zambia</td>
<td>Chatterji et al.</td>
<td>1 160 AIDS-orphans, children with sick caregivers and non-affected children</td>
<td>(1) Children with sick caregivers (2) Non-affected children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Unstandardised</td>
<td>Rwanda: orphans showed higher worry/stress levels than other groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia (2005)</td>
<td>Bhargava</td>
<td>479 AIDS-orphans; 574 orphans from non-AIDS causes</td>
<td>Children; children orphaned from non-AIDS causes</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>Zambia: orphans and children with ill caregivers showed higher worry/stress levels than non-affected children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa (2006)</td>
<td>Cluver and Gardner Nyamukapa et al.</td>
<td>30 AIDS-orphans; 30 non-orphans 5 321 children in total</td>
<td>Non-orphans</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>No subscale differences. Orphans less likely to have good friends; high levels of PTSD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe (2006)</td>
<td>Gilborn et al.</td>
<td>1 258 OVC, 65% orphans (cause of death not given)</td>
<td>Non-orphaned OVC</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Unstandardised</td>
<td>Orphans showed more psychosocial disorders and more severe symptoms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa (2006)</td>
<td>Wild et al.</td>
<td>81 AIDS-orphaned children; 78 orphaned from non-AIDS causes; 43 non-orphans</td>
<td>(1) Non-orphans (2) Children orphaned from non-AIDS causes</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>Orphans showed higher daily stress levels and psychosocial distress on six items of depression, and lower psychosocial well-being on two items (single item analysis)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Respondents: Children; teachers; some guardians; children; children orphaned from non-AIDS causes; children; children orphaned from non-AIDS causes; children; children; children; children; children; children; children; children.

Instruments: Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised; Unstandardised; Standardised.
## Appendix 1: (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country, date</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Sample characteristics</th>
<th>Control groups</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Standardised instruments?</th>
<th>Brief findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Africa (2007)</td>
<td>Cluver <em>et al.</em></td>
<td>455 AIDS-orphaned children; 243 orphaned from non-AIDS causes; 278 non-orphans; 85 orphaned by unknown causes</td>
<td>(1) Non-orphans (2) Children orphaned from non-AIDS causes</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>AIDS-orphans showed more depression, peer problems, PTSD and behaviour problems than other groups. No difference in anxiety.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya (ongoing) Uganda (ongoing)</td>
<td>Elmore-Meegan <em>et al.</em> Lamphear and Jones</td>
<td>Planned 400 children 137 AIDS-orphans; 98 children orphaned from non-AIDS causes; 99 non-orphans</td>
<td>Non-orphans (1) Non-orphans (2) Orphans from non-AIDS causes</td>
<td>Children and caregivers</td>
<td>Unstandardised</td>
<td>Data collection in progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA – New Orleans (1999, 2005)</td>
<td>Forehand, Pelton <em>et al.</em> Longitudinal study</td>
<td>20 AIDS-orphans, compared to children with HIV+ mothers and non-orphaned community controls</td>
<td>(1) Children with HIV+ mothers (2) Non-orphaned children with HIV- mothers</td>
<td>Children and caregivers</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>Data in analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA (2001)</td>
<td>Hirsch</td>
<td>16 AIDS-orphans; 12 children orphaned from non-AIDS causes</td>
<td></td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Standardised</td>
<td>Children orphaned from non-AIDS causes showed higher levels of depression, anxiety and conduct problems than AIDS-orphaned children.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>